Pacem in Terris in a Digital Age

Agnes M. Brazal

Abstract: This paper argues that Pacem in Terris *continues to be relevant in the digital era. After discussing its basic themes on peace and peacebuilding, the essay focuses on new sources of conflicts spawned in the information era and the significance and challenges of the following themes: its positive engagement with the world; the principles of truth, justice, freedom and solidarity which* Pacem *stressed should characterize relationships at all levels; the centrality of respect for human rights for the peace agenda; the recognition of the role of media to build bridges; and the need for transnational authority to regulate issues that go beyond territorial boundaries.*

Key Words: *Pacem in Terris*, peace, peacebuilding, digital era, cyberspace, globalization, communication rights, cultural rights, digital divide

John Paul II's 2003 document "The Communications Media at the Service of Authentic Peace in the Light of '*Pacem in Terris*'" (henceforth "Communications Media") noted that the emerging developments in information and communication technologies (ICT) form part of the cultural context of *Pacem in Terris*.[1] Since its publication in 1963, developments in media communication have grown exponentially.[2]

This paper explores the significance of *Pacem in Terris* in the twenty-first century digital era.[3] The first part elaborates on peace and peacebuilding in *Pacem* in relation to the "world behind" and "world of the text." The second part moves to the "world in front of the text", the digital era, and outlines some of its new or heightened features relevant to the peace agenda. The last section focuses on the challenges of *Pacem in Terris* in relation to new media communications.[4]

---

[1] *Pacem in Terris* will also be referred to as *Pacem* in this essay.

[2] John Paul II, "The Communications Media at the Service of Authentic Peace in the Light of '*Pacem in Terris*'" Message of John Paul II for the 37th World Communications Day (2003) http://www.vatican.va/holy_father/ john_paul_ii/messages/communications/documents/hf_jp-ii_mes_20030124_world-communications-day_en.html (accessed May 2013).

[3] The digital era or information age is characterized by an economy based on information computerization. This has been brought about by the shift from the analog-mechanical and electronic technology to digital technology in the late 20th century.

[4] In a general way, we are guided by the "normativity of the future" in our assertion that a Church document from 1963 can have relevance in the 21st century. See Reimund Bieringer and Mary Elsbernd, "The 'Normativity of the Future' Approach: Its Roots, Development, Current State and Challenges" in *Normativity of the Future: Reading Biblical and Other Authoritative Texts in an Eschatological Perspective*, ed. Reimund Bieringer and Mary Elsbernd (Leuven: Peeters, 2010) 3–26. This is in line with the primacy of the world in front of the text that I elaborated on in my earlier article, "Feminist Ideology Criticism, the Bible, and the Community," *MST Review: A Journal of Theological and Cultural Studies* 2/2 (1999): 97–117.

PEACE AND PEACEBUILDING IN *PACEM IN TERRIS*

Pacem in Terris was written in the context of the Cold War nuclear standoff between the United States and the Soviet Union. Two years earlier in 1961, the Berlin Wall had been built to separate East from West Germany. Just six months before the release of the encyclical, a nuclear war almost erupted when US President John F. Kennedy threatened to block Soviet ships carrying Russian missiles to Cuba.[5] John XXIII wrote a letter to President Kennedy and Soviet Premier Nikita Khrushchev and pleaded that "they do all that is in their power to save peace" and spare the world from a nuclear conflagration. Khrushchev decided to withdraw the missiles a few days later.[6]

Human Rights

In *Pacem in Terris*, peace is defined in terms of the promotion, safeguarding and defence of human rights of peoples at all levels: interpersonal, social, political, and global. Conflict and implicitly war arise in the failure to respect human rights. From within this framework, it becomes understandable why *Pacem* only has few references to concrete issues of peace such as disarmament and the rejection of the use of atomic weapons (n.127, and n.111) and peaceful means of resolving conflicts (nn.111–116).[7]

Seeking to address the deeper roots of conflict, the document, in its listing of the "characteristics of the modern age" focused on developments in previously discriminated groups:[8] the growing voice of the working classes in economic and social affairs (n.40); the increased participation of women in public life (n.41); and the gaining of independence of all nations (n.42).[9] In enumerating thus, the text affirms the development of a new consciousness and conviction that all humans (n.44) and nations (n.89) are equal.[10] The acknowledgment of human rights and duties for the promotion of the common good is, for John XXIII, the condition for the attainment of peace among humans and societies.

---

[5] John Paul II, "*Pacem in Terris*: A Permanent Commitment" "*Pacem in Terris* was an open letter to the world" April 10, 2013, Vatican Insider, http://vaticaninsider.lastampa.it/en/the-vatican/detail/articolo/concilio-23953 (accessed May 2013).

[6] Tony Magliano, "Reflection: Pope John XXIII's prophetic 'Peace on Earth' turns 50" http://paxchristiusa.org/2013/04/16/reflection-pope-john-xxiiis-prophetic-peace-on-earth-turns-50/. That the Pope's message had a profound influence on Kruschev was expressed when he told Saturday Review editor Norman Cousins during the latter's visit to Moscow the following: "In regard to what Pope John did for peace, his was humanistic assistance that will be recorded in history. The Pope and I can diverge on many questions, but we are united in our desire for peace." Giancarlo Zizola, *The Utopia of John XXIII* (New York: Doubleday, 1985), 16, cited by Drew Christiansen, SJ, "Commentary on *Pacem in Terris* (Peace on Earth)" in *Modern Catholic Social Teaching: Commentaries and Interpretations*, ed. Kenneth Himes, OFM, et al. (Washington DC: Georgetown University Press, 2005) 221.

[7] Russell Hittinger, "*Quinquagesimo Ante*: Reflections on *Pacem in Terris* Fifty Years Later" www.pass.va/content/dam/scienzesociali/pdf/acta18/acta18-hittinger.pdf (accessed May 2013); see also Christiansen, "Commentary on *Pacem in Terris* (Peace on Earth)" 223.

[8] John Paul II, "*Pacem in Terris*: A Permanent Commitment" *America* 188/4 (2003): 18.

[9] In 1960, the General Assembly of the United Nations declared the right to self-determination of all peoples. *Pacem* addressed the issue of decolonization – the problem of the "Third World" in nn.121-25. Hittinger, "*Quinquagesimo Ante*" 41.

[10] That "all men are equal," though expressed in gender exclusive language, projects a horizon of inclusivity, especially when qualified by "all" and the earlier reference to the increased consciousness of women who no longer would accept being treated as passive objects (n.41).

The encyclical successfully linked the Church's natural law tradition, which stresses duties and obligations, with the Enlightenment stress on rights.[11] *Pacem* recognized the rights claims in previous encyclicals as well as rights advocated by both socialists and liberals: rights related to physical integrity; cultural, religious, economic, political rights; rights within the family; and right to mobility. Two rights which are for the first time mentioned in an encyclical are the rights of women (n.19, n.41) and the right to religious conscience (n.14).[12] Never before had the Church upheld the equal role of women in public life thus heralding here a shift in Catholic Social Teaching from a hierarchical to equal but complementary theo-anthropological model.[13] While today, women may still find this model limiting, an implicit horizon of inclusivity is present in n.41 when it states that women "are demanding both in domestic and public life the rights and duties which belong to them as human persons." In this statement, the women themselves are described as subjects or articulators of their rights and duties, thus projecting a world when women themselves and not men will define their identities.

More than any other theme in *Pacem in Terris*, the right to religious conscience was subjected to discussion and debate in the drafting process.[14] The encyclical's recognition of the right to worship and freedom of conscience in religious matters, though not putting other religions on an equal footing, renders possible peaceful co-existence and collaboration toward the common good. The right to obey one's conscience in religious matters overturns traditional practice of Catholic governments in the past to circumvent rights of non-Catholic believers.

RELATIONS GUIDED BY TRUTH, JUSTICE, SOLIDARITY AND FREEDOM

Pacem in Terris advocates further the establishment of relations on various levels—"between individual citizens, between citizens and their respective States, between States, and finally between individuals, families, intermediate associations and States on the one hand, and the world community on the other"—guided by truth, justice, charity/solidarity (n.107) and freedom (n.120, n.163). These values are linked to the basic conviction on the equality in dignity, rights and duties of all humans and nations (nn.86–89).[15]

Pacem also upholds that public authority on the local and global level must be committed to the common good. As States are becoming more interdependent, it sees the need for a global governing authority to promote the universal common good.

---

[11] Jerry Filteau, "Experts: *'Pacem in Terris'* had Radical Impact on Church Teaching" *National Catholic Reporter* http://ncronline.org/news/theology/experts-Pacem-terris-had-radical-impact-church-teaching (accessed May 2013).

[12] Hittinger, "*Quinquagesimo Ante.*" On the lack of previous references to such rights see for instance "The Rights of Man: The Feast of Christmas and Suffering Humanity, Broadcast of Pope Pius XII Christmas, 1942" http://catholictradition.org/Encyclicals/1942.htm (accessed May 2013).

[13] In terms of women's economic rights, however, there is the qualification that these must be "consistent with their needs and responsibilities as wives and mothers" (n.19).

[14] Hittinger, "*Quinquagesimo Ante*" 42.

[15] The text elaborated on these as principles to guide the relations between States: truth (nn.86-90), justice (nn.91–93), love/solidarity (nn.98–107) and freedom (n.120).

DISCERNING THE BROADER TRENDS IN HISTORY

Discerning the broader trends in history to identify causes of conflict and address issues of peace was important for John XXIII who was a historian, and for Pietro Pavan, a social ethicist and the material writer of *Pacem*.[16] Though not in the Latin original of *Pacem*, the term "signs of the times" was used by John XXIII in the proclamation calling the Second Vatican Council.[17] Richard Gaillardetz notes that taken together with *Mater et Magistra* and *Gaudium et Spes*, *Pacem* inaugurated a new stage in the Church's relation to the world. While *Pacem* expressed its teaching within a classic scholastic natural law perspective, its tone reflects a more positive attitude and engagement with society.[18]

ROLE OF THE CHURCH IN THE PROMOTION OF PEACE.

Pacem in Terris underlines that peace on earth, manifested in the order in the universe and order among human beings ultimately emanates from God who is the source of this order (n.38). In Jesus Christ's passion, death and resurrection, humanity has been reconciled to God who has bestowed her gifts of peace.

Viewing humanity as one family, the Church sees itself as spokesperson of peoples' deepest desire.[19] It is the duty of the Church to advance the common good of all (n.166). In particular, the Pope as the representative of Christ who is the author of peace (n.167), speaks as a father to all humankind. While still continuing the paternalism of previous encyclicals, an implicit alternative ecclesiology is present in *Pacem* as the Pope states as well the need for collaboration with other people of exemplary wisdom and influence (n.118) to attain peaceful relations between States thus making the Church here less of a parent and more of a companion in a shared project.[20]

NEW CONTEXT: THE DIGITAL ERA

The world in which *Pacem in Terris* emerged is different in a number of ways from our world today. Since the fall of the Berlin wall in 1989, the threat of a nuclear war has receded even if North Korea reminds us from time to time that its possibility cannot

---

[16] Christiansen, "Commentary on *Pacem in Terris* (Peace on Earth)" 224.

[17] Apostolic Constitution *Humanae salutis* (25 Dec. 1961). In this text, the meaning of "signs of the times" is linked to Mt 16:1-5, referring to a shared experience that must be discerned. The term was inserted later above n.126 and seems to have originated from an earlier Italian draft. Hittinger, "*Quinquagesimo Ante*" 54.

[18] Richard Gaillardetz, "The Ecclesiological Foundations of Modern Catholic Social Teaching" in *Modern Catholic Social Teaching: Commentaries and Interpretations*, ed. Kenneth Himes, OFM et al. (Washington DC: Georgetown University Press, 2005) 74.

[19] *Pacem* addresses not only Christians but all peoples of good will. As Cardinal Suenens puts it, *Pacem in Terris* is an "open letter to the world." Hittinger, "*Quinquagesimo Ante*" fn.4.

[20] The basis of Vatican II's model of church–world relations was provided by papal documents such as *Pacem*. See David J. O'Brien, "A Century of Catholic Social Teaching: Contexts and Comments" in *One Hundred Years of Catholic Social Thought* ed. John A. Coleman, SJ (Maryknoll, NY: Orbis, 1991) 23.

completely be disregarded.[21] The threat to peace then, arose from "strong states." In the digital era, the threat to peace also emanates from "non-state actors."[22]

NEW CENTRES OF POWER

While one can contest the claim that the power of the nation-state, which is tied to territoriality, has declined in our period of techno-economic globalization,[23] it is undeniable that other centres of power have emerged: multinational corporations; the global media whose influence has increased with the rise of implicit and persuasive power;[24] and global organized crime related for instance to trade in drug, sex, and weapons.[25]

Chat rooms and e-groups enable people with the same interests or lifestyles to connect. Those who are able to utilize the network for their purposes have gained greater power than those who have not.[26] This includes not only socially oriented movements but also terrorists, fundamentalist, and paedophiles, who are now able to coalesce more freely, being less prone to sanction. White supremacists and racist skinheads have made ample use of the internet to spread their ideology of hate against the non–whites.[27] The internet is likewise replete with images, postings and websites that reinforce gender stereotype, gender discrimination and violence against women.[28]

THE DIGITAL DIVIDE

The problem of the digital divide is another major issue in the digital age. The term "digital divide" refers not only to unequal access to a computer but to inequalities as well in the

---

[21] Thomas Blackburn, "After Thirty Years, *Pacem in Terris* hasn't Lost its Glow" *National Catholic Reporter*, 30/18 (5 November, 1993) 18.

[22] See Hamadoun I. Touré and the Permanent Monitoring Panel on Information Security World Federation of Scientists, The Quest for Cyberpeace (International Telecommunication Union, 2011) http://www.itu.int/ dms_pub/itu-s/opb/gen/S-GEN-WFS.01-1-2011-PDF-E.pdf (accessed May 2013).

[23] See for instance, Sylvia Walby, "The Myth of the Nation-State: Theorizing Society and Polities in a Global Era" *Sociology* 37/3 (2003): 530.

[24] In contrast to the explicit power (legislative, executive, and judicial) of the nation-state, implicit and persuasive power of global media conglomerates is able to sway public opinion.

[25] Manuel Castells, *The Information Age: Economy, Society and Culture*, vol. 2, *The Power of Identity* 2nd ed. (MA: Blackwell Publishing, 1997/2004) 259; Idem, *The Information Age: Economy, Society and Culture*, vol. 3, *End of Millennium* (MA: Blackwell Publishing, 1998/2000) 183–95.

[26] The Net is not just a tool for organizing and advocacy; it represents a novel way of social communication, mobilizing and making decisions in various senses: there is no central authority; there exists an immediate link between the local and the global making possible thinking locally and acting globally; and "all nodes can contribute to the network" to strengthen and expand it while malfunctioning nodes can be easily bypassed. Castells, *The Power of Identity* 156.

[27] Colin Beckels, "Black Struggles in Cyberspace: Cyber-Segregation and Cyber–Nazis" *The Western Journal of Black Studies* 21/1 (1997): 14–16.

[28] See Jeane Peracullo, "Resistance/Collusion with Masculinist-Capitalist Fantasies? Japanese and Filipino Women in the Cyber–Terrain" in *Wired Asia: Ethical-Religious and Feminist Perspectives* ed. Agnes M. Brazal and Kochurani Abraham; Heather Walton, "The Gender of the Cyborg" *Theology and Sexuality* 10/2 (2004): 34–37; Flora Carandang, "Internet Relationship Experiences of Senior Students of the School of the Holy Spirit of Quezon City: Ethical Challenges" (MA Religious Studies thesis, Maryhill School of Theology, 2012) 87–88, for accounts of teenage girls' experience of sexual harassment in cyberspace.

capacity to fully utilize the technology to improve one's life.[29] This is due to economic, technical or socio-cultural factors that restrict some social groups' access to new media thereby producing a gap between the "information rich" and the "information poor." The gender digital divide results from the restriction of women's use of new media such as the prohibition to single Moslem girls to carry a mobile phone in North Western India.[30] In places where it is easy to go online such as Singapore, the digital divide is drawn based more on the quality of access. The women, the elderly, the less educated generally comprise the digitally (s)lower class who do not see the value in going online or simply do it for social interactions in contrast to the virtual class who use the internet generate knowledge or to earn.[31]

But even as there are regions in urban and rural areas bypassed by ICT, also called by Manuel Castells as the "fourth world", everyone feels the impact of the processes occurring in the socially decisive global networks that organize production, consumption, communication and power. This double logic of inclusion and exclusion is, according to Castells, not just due to a delay in people's inclusion but is, rather, integral to the global capitalist network society which ignores places, activities and people that are of no value in relation to this aim of the network because they neither produce nor consume. While the network structure is pliable, he emphasizes that one thing is clear, the domination of those excluded from the networks.[32]

IDENTITY RECONSTRUCTION AND ETHNO-FUNDAMENTALISM

With instantaneous global communication and improvements in mass transportation, today's generation is likewise exposed to a variety of cultures, religions, and ideas which challenge them to be highly reflexive. In this context, Castells identifies the quest for human identity as among the important issues in our networked world. In his analysis, identities in late modernity are constructed more in the context of communal resistance to exclusion.[33] Resistance identity, in general, is formed by oppressed or marginalized groups in response to their domination leading to the "exclusion of the excluders by the excluded." Examples of resistance identities such as religious fundamentalism, cultural nationalism, and territorial communes, are reactions to perceived threats arising from a network society such as: 1) the weakening of the sovereignty of institutions like the nation-state; 2) the increasing fluidity in the boundaries of ethnic membership and involvement; 3) and the crisis of the patriarchal family brought about by the rise in gender consciousness.

---

[29] Joseph Wilson and Hadson Wilson, "Digital Divide: Impediment to ICT and Peace Building in Developing Countries" *American Communication Journal* 11/2 (2009): 4–5.

[30] Virginia Saldanha, "Digital Revolution – Creating a Flat World for Indian Women?" in *Feminist Cyberethics in Asia: Religious Discourses on Human Connectivity* ed. Agnes M. Brazal and Kochurani Abraham (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2014) 49.

[31] Shirley Soh, "Reading the Cyborg in Singapore: Technology, Gender, and Empowerment," in *Feminist Cyberethics in Asia* 38.

[32] Manuel Castells, *Communication Power* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2009) 25–26.

[33] Castells defines identity as "the process of construction of meaning on the basis of a cultural attribute, or a related set of cultural attributes, that is given priority over other sources of meaning." Castells, *The Power of Identity*, 6-7. Identities are different from social roles which organize functions in that the former are more powerful sources of meaning that are produced in a process of individuation. Ibid. 7.

[New] Communications Media in the light of *Pacem in Terris*

Imbued with *Pacem*'s spirit of positive engagement with the world and discernment of the signs of the times, Vatican documents have regarded developments in new communications media as "great gifts of God and true signs of the times."[34] In the context of the new sources of conflict in the digital age, what are some challenges of *Pacem* in relation to new media?

Principles of Truth, Justice, Freedom, Solidarity

John Paul II in the document "Communications Media" pointed out that both world and media can still learn from the message of John XXIII. Applying the norms identified by *Pacem* to guide various forms of relations (n.163), John Paul II in "Communications Media" elaborates on the duty of media to uphold truth, freedom, justice and love/solidarity. Though "Communications Media" was addressed to media professionals, these principles identified by John XXIII are fruitful resources for guiding all individuals or groups making use of computer mediated communication networks, as shown in their deployment by later Church documents as norms in addressing cyber-communication issues.

Media and Truth

Communication, according to John Paul II, must be in the service of truth. Truth pertains not only to facts or accurate information but also to those relating to the vocation of humans as persons, the common good of society, and our relationship with the Divine. As *Pacem* underlines, the truth regarding the equality in dignity of humans and nations compels us to fight racial discrimination (nn.86–89) and calls for the rejection of the use of modern means of communication to spread "information which violate the principles of truth and justice, and injure the reputation of another nation" (n.90). In line with this, the Pontifical Commission for Social Communications (PCSC) expresses concern regarding hate sites aimed at attacking religious and ethnic groups."[35] The 2002 document by the PCSC critiques further the radical libertarianism or absolutization of freedom at the expense of truth, which internet culture can foster.[36]

Media and Justice

John Paul II related media and justice to *Pacem in Terris*' stress on the universal common good. Justice can be served by faithfully representing events, and correctly discussing and presenting issues from the perspective of various standpoints. *Pacem* points out that justice requires the recognition of mutual rights and duties (n.35). It speaks of the need to serve the best interest of justice, for public authorities to enhance the situation of minority groups especially in what pertains to their language and culture (n.96).

Employing as well the principle of justice, "Ethics in Internet" stresses the responsibility of public institutions to close the digital divide, including the gender divide

---

[34] Pontifical Council for Social Communication (henceforth, PCSC), "Ethics in Communication" n.4, http://www.vatican.va/roman_curia/pontifical_councils/pccs/documents/rc_pc_pccs_doc_20000530_ethics-communications_en.html (accessed May 2013).

[35] PCSC, "The Church and Internet" n. 8, http://www.vatican.va/roman_curia/pontifical_councils/pccs/documents/rc_pc_pccs_doc_20020228_church–internet_en.html (accessed May 2013).

[36] PCSC, "Ethics in Internet".

(n.10).[37] One means it proposes is to link the internet to lower cost media (n.10).[38] John Paul II likewise underlined the need to find ways to help those in the weaker social sectors have access to information, and to participate in the generation of media content and effective social communication polices and structures. [39]

Media and Freedom

In *Pacem in Terris*, freedom is "the use of means which are consistent with the dignity of" the individual members of society, "who being endowed with reason, assume responsibility for their actions" (n.35). John Paul II stressed that it is access to true and adequate information that serves freedom. This presupposes though that media itself operates in an atmosphere of freedom. While media should be regulated, the Pope cautioned that it should not be controlled by the government. *Pacem*'s teaching on the right to obey one's conscience is echoed in John Paul II's injunction for media people to follow their conscience and not cave in to pressures from the wealthy and the politically powerful. In a 2007 document on "Children and Media," Benedict XVI further encourages formation in the proper exercise of freedom which is not simply the pursuit of happiness and novel experiences but the capacity to choose what is true good and beautiful.[40]

Media and Solidarity

Love or solidarity in *Pacem in Terris* is a feel for the needs of others as if they are one's own leading toward sharing of goods and mutual collaboration (n.35, n.98). John Paul II linked this to the role of media in building trust amongst peoples and nations, which was also stressed in *Pacem* (n.113). "Ethics in Internet" (n.15) speaks too of the virtue of solidarity as "the measure of the Internet's service of the common good. For it is the common good that supplies the context for considering the ethical question: 'Are the media being used for good or evil?'"

PEACEBUILDING THROUGH ICT

Pacem in Terris was referring to information and communication technologies when it spoke of the "many aids to the promotion and spread of mutual understanding between nations which modern scientific progress has made available. (n.90)" John Paul II in "Communications Media" concurs that "the media have enormous potential for promoting peace and building bridges between peoples."[41] Today some of the concrete ways interactive media can help in the task of peacebuilding are as follows.[42]

---

[37] It states that it is the responsibility of public institutions to provide a free "resource of comprehensive information and services available without charge to all, and in a wide range of languages." PCSC, "Ethics in Internet" n.10.

[38] See for instance "Smart Policies to Close the Digital Divide" http://unpan1.un.org/intradoc/groups/public/ documents/un-dpadm/unpan049753.pdf (accessed May 2013)

[39] John Paul II. "Internet: A New Forum for Proclaiming the Gospel" (2002) http://www.vatican.va/ holy_father/john_paul_ii/messages/communications/documents/hf_jp-ii_mes_20020122_world-communications-day_en.html (accessed May 2013).

[40] Benedict XVI, "Children and the Media: A Challenge for Education" (2007), http://www.vatican.va/ holy_father/benedict_xvi/messages/communications/documents/hf_ben-xvi_mes_20070124_41st-world-communications-day_en.html (accessed May 2013).

[41] John Paul II, "Communications Media" (2005).

[42] Wilson and Wilson, "Digital Divide" 1–9.

ICT can be used for education for peace. In Sierra Leone for instance, the International Education and Research Network employed multimedia education featuring essays, images and music on the effects of civil war to rehabilitate more than 200 ex–child soldiers. However, because of lack of access to ICT, they had to be brought by bus to the cities or they had to walk and line up for hours to access computers in an Internet café.

ICT can be employed to disseminate information. For example, the Kubatana project in Zimbabwe connects 230 civil and community–based groups and disseminates information on new laws, the electoral process, and social issues such as HIV/AIDS.

Online discussion groups can help clarify sources of conflict and means toward resolution. In the eruption of clashes in Burundi, Burundinet and the Burundi Youth Council organized online discussion groups allowing Burundians from various backgrounds to discuss and debate and find ways to help resolve the conflict, despite the difficulty to meet face to face.

ICT can foster relationships among peoples of various ethnic groups. Social networking sites and personal websites help people understand those who are culturally different as well as enhance awareness of our basic similarities as humans.

ICT empower women against domestic and other forms of violence as they can more easily communicate with others and gather evidence to file a suit.[43]

Conflicts can also arise due to scarcity of resources. With ICT, it is easier for farmers to market their products as they can source markets that will pay a good price for their products via cell phone.

There are times when a single government decision leads to a situation of peace or conflict. ICT can provide a space for a dialogue between citizens and leaders on a proposed bill or policy.

ICT can be a tool for mobilizing protests including a peaceful revolution. Examples are the use of cell phones and SMS in the Philippines to oust peacefully President Joseph Estrada[44] and the role the internet played in the Egyptian revolt against Mubarak.[45]

PUSHING FORWARD THE HUMAN RIGHTS DISCOURSE

The potentials of ICT for peacebuilding however will not be realized if the digital divide is not adequately addressed.[46] Concomitant with addressing the digital divide is the promotion of communication and cultural rights.

---

[43] See Saldanha, "Digital Revolution."

[44] See Wilson and Wilson, "Digital Divide" 2–3 for other examples of the use of ICT for peacebuilding. See also "Internet and Social Change in Asia" *Peace Review* 13/3 (2001): 381–87.

[45] In Egypt, though an estimate of only 20 percent has access to the internet, this had nevertheless played a role in the organization and mobilization of the revolt in Egypt against Mubarak. They were able to create networks and establish external linkages that provide support to the revolution. It allowed them to circumvent State censorship of the press and they were able to garner further support via texting, traditional phone calls and face to face conversations. Xiaolin Zhuo, Barry Wellman, and Justine Yu, "Egypt: The First Internet Revolt?" *Peace Magazine* (Jul/Sept 2011): 7–10.

Right to Communicate/Communication Rights[47]

With the revolution in global telecommunications, the right to communicate has been recognized as universal basic right, because it's fulfilment on the personal and social level is necessary to enjoy other rights.

In *Pacem*, the right to communicate can be derived from the "freedom of speech and publication," and right "to be accurately informed about public events" (n.12).[48] This is supported by the "right to share in the benefits of culture" (n.13) implying that access to technological developments is not just reserved for those who can afford it but must be accessible to everyone. To ensure this, there must be adequate literacy rates as well expressed in *Pacem* as the right to "receive a good general education."[49] Correspondingly, this implies on the part of the government the duty to provide adequate education for all.

The concept of the right to communicate, first put forward by Jean D'Arcy in 1969,[50] differs from the "mass media" understanding of "freedom of information," characterized by a unidirectional, vertical flow of homogenous information. With instantaneous global communication, the right to communicate includes not only the right to hear, but also to be heard; not only the right to be informed but also to inform. It involves "*participatory, interactive, horizontal,* and *multi-way* communication."[51] Furthermore, whereas before, rights such as freedom of speech, freedom of the press, freedom of assembly in the UDHR, were conceptualized as separate rights with its own sphere of communication, today, one can practice all of these rights simultaneously in one sphere – cyberspace.

Jim McDonnell posits that Paul VI, in *Communio et Progressio* (1971), foreshadowed the notion of a right to communicate when he devoted a full section on the "right to receive and give information" (nn.33–47). The 1992 document *Aetatis Novae* n.15 explicitly supports the "right to communicate" as the right of all:

> It is not acceptable that the exercise of the freedom of communication should depend upon wealth, education, or political power. The right to communicate is the right of all. This calls for special national and international efforts, not only to give those who are poor and less powerful access to the information which they need for their individual and social development, but to ensure that they are able to play an effective,

---

46 Wilson and Wilson, "Digital Divide."

47 William McIver Jr., Willian Birdsall, and Merrilee Rasmussen, "The Internet and the Right to Communicate" *First Monday*, http://firstmonday.org/ojs/index.php/fm/article/view/1102/1022#m2 (accessed May 2013).

48 In the Universal Declaration of Human Rights (UDHR), the right to communicate is based on art. 19 which states everyone's right to freedom of opinion and expression. Art. 19 is supported by Art. 27, sec. 1 which says: "Everyone has the right freely to participate in the cultural life of the community, to enjoy the arts and to share in scientific advancement and its benefits." (United Nations, 1997).

49 This is in principle, addressed by UDHR, Art. 28 which states: "Everyone is entitled to a social and international order in which the rights and freedoms set forth in this Declaration can be fully realized." (United Nations, 1997)

50 Jean D'Arcy, Director of Radio and Visual Services in the UN Office of Public Information stated: "The time will come when the (UDHR) will have to encompass a more extensive right than man's right to information, first laid down 21 years ago in Article 19. This is the right of man to communicate if it is to be fully understood." Alan Alegre, "Communication Rights," http://vecam.org/article670.html (accessed May 2013).

51 Ibid.

responsible role in deciding media content and determining the structures and policies of their national institutions of social communications.[52]

It also underlines that the right to communicate, which is a duty of the Church to promote, includes the "right to religious freedom, which should not be confined to freedom of worship."

In terms of the context in which they emerged, the "right to communicate" differs from "communication rights" discourse. On the one hand, the right to communicate developed in the 1980s and advocates its legal acknowledgement to facilitate its implementation. This spawned the New World Information and Communication Order (NWICO) debate. Opposition to a right to communicate ranged from the charge of unnecessary importation of Western values on the one hand, to the fear of undesirable government intervention on the other hand. The "communication rights" discourse, on its part, started to take shape in the 1990s from NGOs and activists, who coalesced to stress that these international rights are already there but are simply disregarded.[53] The recognition of communication rights pushes for the full realization of freedom of expression as it further addresses the power relations and interests that restrict people's access to communication, and promotes respect for diversity.

Cultural Rights

The right to communicate is a form of cultural right. In *Pacem*, the cultural rights which have been mentioned are those in the section on "rights pertaining to moral and cultural values," "right to worship God according to one's conscience," and "right of meeting and association".

Cultural rights, as developed in *Pacem*, goes beyond individual rights to include as well respect for distinctive characteristics of each group (n.55).[54] It recognized the problems of discrimination against national minorities and immigrants (n.94, n.106). It is the duty of the government to promote the welfare of minority ethnic groups, "especially in what concerns their language, culture, ancient traditions, and their economic activity and enterprise" (n.96).[55]

---

[52] *Pontificium Consilium de Communicationibus Socialibus, Aetatis Novae* http://www.vatican.va/roman_curia/ pontifical_councils/pccs/documents/rc_pc_pccs_doc_22021992_aetatis_en.html (accessed May 2013).

[53] "Communication – An Essential Human Need" http://www.crisinfo.org/ (accessed May 2013).

[54] A skeletal catalogue of what can be considered as cultural rights can already be found in international instruments such as the Universal Declarations of Human Rights (1948) and the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (ICESCR; 1966) and in regional declarations such as the American Declaration on the Rights and Duties of Men (1948), the Additional Protocol to the American Convention on Human Rights in the Area of Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (1988), and in the African Charter on Human and People's Rights (1981). These documents focus on cultural rights as rights of the individual. The notion of cultural rights as "collective right" or "group-specific" right has also been recognized implicitly in the ICESCR and International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR; 1966). This is explicitly acknowledged in the 1982 World Conference on Cultural Policies, as well as, in the Declaration on the Rights of Persons Belonging to National or Ethnic, Religious and Linguistic Minorities (1992). A number of other documents cataloguing cultural rights have also been produced. Halina Niec, "Advocating for Cultural Rights: Cultural Rights at the End of the World Decade for Cultural Development" 7 http://kvc.minbuza.nl/uk/archive/commentary/ niec.html (accessed May 2006).

[55] Pontifical Council on Social Communications, "Church and Internet".

An important document in the development of the concept of cultural rights is the 2007 Fribourg declaration which basically defines cultural rights as right to cultural expression, identity and development.[56] It highlights the link between cultural rights and identity and presupposes a dynamic concept of culture. Among the cultural rights it lists which can be considered communication rights are the right to participate in cultural life and policies, education and training in a way that respects the plurality of cultures, right to information, protection of scientific, artistic and creative output and ownership and the right to "respond to erroneous information concerning cultures."[57]

In relation to cultural rights, the 2002 Vatican document "Church and Internet," has noted the problem of hate sites that maligns ethnic and religious groups (n.8).[58] "Ethics in Internet" in turn cautions against the dominance of Western values in the Internet.

> [T]he Internet, along with the other media of social communication, is transmitting the value–laden message of Western secular culture to people and societies in many cases ill-prepared to evaluate and cope with it. Many serious problems result—for example, in regard to marriage and family life, which are experiencing 'a radical and widespread crisis' in many parts of the world. (n.11)

In reaction to cultural domination, some groups according to *Pacem* may regard their ethnic characteristics as holding primacy "above human values" (n.97). With significant foresight of today's problem on resistance identities' exclusion of the excluders, *Pacem* rejects preventing reciprocal relations between various cultures (n.100). It stresses the need to promote interaction instead of creating distances. *Pacem* emphasizes how the "genius and spirit" of cultures can be enhanced in their interaction with other cultures: "But for this to happen these minority groups must enter into some kind of association with the people in whose midst they are living, and learn to share their customs and way of life" (n.97).[59] The internet can provide a space for peoples of various cultures and religions to interact, be enriched by one another, and work for peace.[60]

---

[56] The Observatory of Diversity and Cultural Rights at the University of Fribourg, together with the Organisation Internationale de la Francophonie and UNESCO, jointly launched the Fribourg Declaration on Cultural Rights on May 7, 2007 at the Palais des Nations in Geneva in May 8. Many human rights advocates and NGOs support the declaration.

[57] Other cultural rights includes respect for cultural identity and the different ways this can be manifested, access to heritages, respect for identification with one or more cultural communities simultaneously regardless of borders, and the right to change this choice. Niec, "Advocating for Cultural Rights" 8.

[58] Pontifical Council on Social Communications, "Church and Internet".

[59] See also Ethics in Internet n. 11: "Intercultural dialogue and enrichment are of course highly desirable…. But this has to be a two-way street. Cultures have much to learn from one another, and merely imposing the world view, values, and even language of one culture upon another is not dialogue but cultural imperialism."

[60] For example, KusogMindanaw – Yahoo Group in the Philippines "is an interactive forum on issues involving Mindanao and its varied peoples. It shall promote dialogue among peoples that they may act with justice; live in fellowship with all; and work for peace and integrity of creation. KusogMindanaw – Yahoo Group is a PLATFORM that provides venue for Mindanao leaders and stakeholders to address, discuss and arrive at consensus on relevant and strategic issues and concerns that affect Mindanao. The KusogMinanaw – Yahoo Group is INCLUSIVE of all peoples who identify and in solidarity with the aspirations and dreams of the peoples of Mindanao." http://groups.yahoo.com/neo/groups/kusogmindanaw/info?v=1&t=directory&ch= web&pub=groups&sec=dir&slk=9 (accessed May 2013).

TRANSNATIONAL REGULATION

Lastly, *Pacem* speaks of the increasing economic interdependence among nations and the limitation of our political structures that are not able to address peace and security issues that go beyond national borders.[61] Along the same line, the document "Ethics in Internet" (2002) endorses the need for transnational regulation (n.17).

Today, aside from the issue of the digital divide which must be addressed on the global level, new forms of cyber-based conflicts have emerged such as transnational crime, espionage and cyber-terrorism.[62] Of particular concern are cyber-crimes aimed at disrupting or destroying critical infrastructures, thus threatening health, economic or political security or the smooth functioning of the State. [63] Examples would be taking control of nuclear power plants, power grids, and dams. This becomes cyber-terrorism when it is aimed at pressuring a people or the State to consent to some social or political goals.[64] The development of the virus Stutnex capable of disrupting a nuclear facility is believed to have moved forward the cyber-arms race with countries investing in developing more powerful malwares.[65] In dealing against such cyber-based conflicts, the danger is to compromise the right to privacy in the process of "dataveillance" or the gathering of data from our electronic trails.

Transnational governance and authority to promote the universal common good can be instituted in the form of cybercrime treaties, and cybercrime convention.[66] An example is the Convention on Cybercrime adopted by the Council of Europe in 2001 which addresses violations of copyright laws, security network, espionage through the harmonization of criminal laws and procedure for investigation and prosecution or alternatively, the Shanghai Cooperation Organization adopted by China, Russia and some Eastern European countries.[67]

---

[61] John Paul II further expounds that media must be committed to the common good which goes beyond that of the nation but encompasses the entire human family (*Pacem* n.132, cited by "Communications Media" n.4)."

[62] "Ethics in Internet" n.9. See also "Obama BANS U.S. government from buying Chinese-made computer technology over cyber-attack fears" March 28, 2013 (accessed May 2014), http://www.dailymail.co.uk/news/ article-2300518/Obama-BANS-U-S-government-buying-Chinese-technology-cyber-attack-fears.html #comments (accessed May 2013).

[63] Cybercrime can be classified into three types: 1) computer-related cybercrimes where the computer is simply the tool for the commitment of the crime (e.g. fraud and theft); 2) content-based cybercrimes where computer is used as means to disseminate illegal data (e.g. infringement of copyright, child pornography); 3) computer integrity offences where the goal is to "compromise the integrity, availability and confidentiality of the computers and systems connected to the internet and the data being processed on them" (e.g. hacking and spread of viruses). Ian Walden, "Crime and Security in Cyberspace" *Cambridge Review of International Affairs* 18/1 (2005): 52.

[64] A. Clem, S. Galwankar, and G. Buck, "Health Implications of Cyber-terrorism" *Pre-hospital and Disaster Medicine* 18/3 (2003): 272, cited by Jonathan Matusitz, "Cyberterrorism: Postmodern State of Chaos," *Information Security Journal: A Global Perspective* 17 (2008): 180.

[65] Misha Glenny, "The Cyberarms Race has Begun" *The Nation* (October 31, 2011): 17–20.

[66] See Ian Walden, "Crime and Security in Cyberspace" *Cambridge Review of International Affairs* 8/1 (2005): 51–68.

[67] Nazli Choucri and Daniel Goldsmith, "Lost in Cyberspace: Harnessing the Internet, International Relations, and Global Security" *Bulletin of the Atomic Scientists* 68/2 (2012): 72. See http://www.opendemocracy.net/od-russia/irina-borogan/future-of-russias-i-curtain (accessed May 2013).

CONCLUSION

The digital age has spawned new sources of escalating conflicts as well as means for building peace. Nevertheless, the message of John XXIII in *Pacem in Terris* continues to be relevant in this new context. First, his emphasis on reading the trends in history to discern on shared experience and his positive engagement with the world has contributed toward creating a culture in the Church that is more receptive to technological developments such as what we now see expressed in relation to new information and communications technology. Secondly, the principles of truth, justice, freedom and solidarity which *Pacem* stressed should characterize relationships at all levels, have been found useful by John Paul II and others in the Vatican as norms for guiding cyber communications. Thirdly, *Pacem*'s teaching on the centrality of the equality of human rights and duties of all peoples and nations, and its recognition of the role of communication technologies to build bridges amongst peoples calls the Church in our new context, to address the digital divide as well as promote communication and cultural rights. Finally, *Pacem*'s identification of the need for transnational authority to regulate issues that go beyond territorial boundaries is very much applicable in the context of cyber-based crimes and conflicts today.

Author: *Agnes M. Brazal is Director of Office for Research and Publications and Graduate Program Coordinator of the St. Vincent School of Theology–Adamson University, Philippines. Her publications include the following co-edited Asian anthologies:* Feminist Cyberethics in Asia *(Palgrave Macmillan, 2014), and* Transformative Ethics, Faith on the Move, and Body and Sexuality *(Ateneo de Manila University Press, 2010, 2008, 2007 respectively). She obtained her SThD/PhD in Theology from the Katholieke Universiteit Leuven, Belgium.*
Email*: agnesmbrazal@gmail.com*